



Oifig an Ard-Rúnaí
An Roinn Oideachais agus Scileanna



Office of the Secretary General
Department of Education and Skills

Ms Margaret Falsey,
Secretariat,
Committee of Public Accounts,
Houses of the Oireachtas,
Dublin 2.

Ref No.: S1713202

12 May 2017

C&AG Special Report 96: Cost of Child Abuse Inquiry and Redress

Caranua Financial Statements 2014 & Caranua Financial Statements 2015

Dear Ms Falsey,

I wish to refer to your letter of 25 April last regarding the supply of further information arising from the Committee's examination of the above matters on 13 April last.

I enclose, herewith, notes for the information of the Committee in respect of the items which were raised in your letter. Also enclosed is an update on contributions from religious congregations in respect of property.

The issue of Caranua moving premises was also raised by the Clerk to the Committee of Public Accounts in a letter dated 8th May 2017. I responded to that separately by way of letter of 10 May last.

Yours sincerely,

Seán Ó Foghlú,
Secretary General

Information Notes for the Committee of Public Accounts
Department of Education and Skills

Item 1: A note on meetings held with Religious Organisations since 2009 to include:

- **List of all meetings and minutes/contemporaneous notes taken**
- **Outcome of each meeting.**

In the immediate aftermath of the publication, on 20 May 2009, of the report of the Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (the “Ryan Report”) the Government began to consider the issues arising. A number of meetings with the religious congregations took place, initially involving the Taoiseach and/or officials from his Department and all of which involving the Minister for Education and Skills and/or his officials.

The purpose of the initial meetings with the religious congregations was to discuss the findings of the publication of the Ryan Report and the response thereto, particularly the calls made by Dáil Éireann, in a unanimous motion, that substantial contributions were required from the congregations by way of reparation. The 15 April 2010 meeting discussed the voluntary offers made by the congregations in late 2009, the need to augment those offers and the uses to which the contributions would be put (including the proposed statutory fund for former residents – now Caranua). In 2010, bilateral meetings were held between Government officials and representatives of all 18 congregations. In 2011, a meeting took place between the then Minister for Education and Skills and 14 of the congregations. Separate meetings were subsequently held with the remaining congregations. Since 2011, only bilateral meetings have been held.

Details of these meetings are set out in the tabular format below. Where applicable, copies of minutes or notes of these meetings are enclosed.

Date of meeting	Government representatives	Religious congregations represented	Purpose of meeting	Outcome of meeting – where relevant
4 June 2009	Taoiseach, senior ministers and officials	Representatives of all 18 religious congregations attended.	Discussion on findings of the Ryan Report, the need for congregations to make significant additional contributions and how those would be measured against their resources.	Press release issued by Government enclosed. Press release also issued by congregations - enclosed. Minutes enclosed. List of proposed attendees enclosed.
24 June 2009	Taoiseach, senior ministers and officials	Representatives of 17 religious congregations attended.	Follow- up to previous meeting with particular reference to the issue of congregational resources. The proposal to establish	Press release issued by Government. Minutes enclosed.

			an independent panel to review congregational assets was noted.	
7 July 2009	Officials from Department of the Taoiseach and Department of Education and Skills	Representatives of two congregations (on behalf of all 18) attended.	To discuss issues arising in relation to the preparation of reports of Statements of Affairs by the congregations and related matters.	Minutes enclosed ¹ .
15 April 2010	Taoiseach, senior ministers and officials	Representatives of all 18 religious congregations attended.	To discuss the offers made by the congregations in late 2009, the report of the Independent Panel and the need to augment their offers to achieve a 50:50 share.	Press release issued by Government. Minutes enclosed.
May 2010	Officials of Department of Education and Skills (and in the case of some meetings the Department of Finance)	Bilateral meetings with representatives of the following congregations: Dominican Order (11 May) Sisters of Nazareth (11 May) Brothers of Charity (12 May) Hospitaller Order of St John of God (12 May) Daughters of Charity (18 May) De La Salle Brothers (18 May) Religious Sisters of Charity (18 May) Oblates of Mary Immaculate (19 May) Sisters of the Good Shepherd (19 May) Daughters of the Heart of Mary (20 May) Sisters of St. Louis (20 May) Presentation Sisters (20 May) Christian Brothers (20 May) Presentation Brothers (21 May) Sisters of St Clare (21 May) Rosminians (24 May)	Discussion on issues including: the realisation of each congregation's offer (of cash or property); the views of congregations on proposals to establish a statutory fund for former residents; and the response of individual congregation's to the call for a further contribution to achieve a 50:50 sharing.	Detailed discussions with each congregation. Minutes of all meetings enclosed.

¹ While these minutes are watermarked "draft", they are the final version.

		Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy (24 May) Sisters of Our Lady of Charity (26 May)		
22 July 2011	Minister for Education & Skills and officials	Representatives of 14 of the 18 congregations attended.	Discussion on a range of issues including a call on congregations to augment contributions to achieve a 50:50 share and the Government's plans for a statutory fund.	Minutes enclosed.
21 November 2011	Minister for Education & Skills and officials	Meetings with the Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy and the Rosminians.	Discussion on issues raised at meeting of 22 July.	Minutes enclosed.
21 November 2011	Minister for Education & Skills and officials	Meeting with the Christian Brothers.	Discussion on issues relating to the Congregation's contribution including its cash offer and the offer to transfer its playing fields.	Minutes enclosed.
13 December 2011	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Meeting with the Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy.	Discussion on proposed statutory fund for former residents.	Minutes enclosed.
16 December 2011	Minister for Education & Skills and officials	Meetings with the Sisters of Our lady of Charity and the Daughters of the Heart of Mary.	Discussion on issues raised at meeting of 22 July.	Minutes enclosed.
24 January 2012	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Oblates of Mary Immaculate	Discussion on proposed statutory fund for former residents.	Minutes enclosed.
6 February 2012	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Rosminians	Discussion on the Congregation's financial position.	Minutes enclosed.
13 July 2012	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Oblates of Mary Immaculate	Discussion on the proposed statutory fund for former residents and the Congregation's planned contribution.	Minutes enclosed.
20 November 2012	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Christian Brothers	Discussion on the Congregation's playing fields offer.	Minutes enclosed.
10 December 2012	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Presentation Brothers	Discussion on the completion of the Congregation's cash	Minutes enclosed.

			offer and related matters.	
17 April 2013	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Daughters of Charity	Discussion on the completion of the Congregation's cash offer.	Minutes enclosed
6 May 2014	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills and others	Meeting with the Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy.	Discussion on the completion of property transfers.	Minutes enclosed.
17 June 2014	Officials of the Department of Education and Skills	Meeting with the Sisters of Our Lady of Charity	Discussion on the completion of property transfer.	Minutes enclosed
12 November 2014	Minister for Education and Skills and officials.	Meeting with the Daughters of Charity	Discussion on the completion of the Congregation's planned contribution.	Minutes enclosed

Item 2: A note on the service provided by Barnardos to help people reconnect with families and any issues in relation to this service.

With Department of Education and Skills' support, Barnardos has provided an Information and Tracing service, known as the "Origins" service, to former residents of institutions since 2002. Access to the Origins service has been on a self-referral basis. Having previously also dealt with applications for records from former residents of industrial and reformatory schools, the service has, since 2007, dealt exclusively with tracing family members on behalf of former residents of the institutions named in the schedule of the Residential Institutions Redress Act 2002.

The service's professional counsellors meet with clients to discuss the process and to explain any information obtained, etc. The service arranges contacts between a client and any family members identified subject to necessary consents being obtained and it mediates between the client and family members as required.

The Service currently operates out of the Barnardos office in Dublin. The operation of the service is governed by the terms of a Performance Delivery Agreement between Barnardos and the Department.

About one third of cases now lead to reunion with a family member. Some applicants are seeking assistance with issues such as locating family graves and understanding complex family histories. The service is also dealing with reactivated enquiries from previous applicants who need support with difficult family tracing outcomes. The Barnardos team remain available to provide practical and emotional support to former residents and their birth families.

Officials meet regularly with Barnardos to review the service and the latest meeting was held on 11 April 2017. The congregations are co-operating fully with the service and Barnardos have confirmed that they regularly request information from the various religious

congregations 'on behalf of applicants to the service in order to assist in family tracing. It is our understanding that many of the Orders have appointed archivists to deal with these queries. Requests from Barnardos are dealt with professionally and courteously and information is forwarded to us as promptly as possible. We have a good working relationship with the Orders in this regard'.

Item 3: A list of the 24 institutions that contribute to the redress scheme.

Listed below are the 24 residential institutions named in the Schedule to the Residential Institutions Redress Act 2002 (as amended) the relevant management body of which was invited, in late 2010, to consider making a voluntary contribution towards the cost of the response to residential institutional child abuse. No contributions were forthcoming from that process. The management bodies concerned were not a party to the 2002 Indemnity Agreement. The Department of Education and Skills does not have access to information on the number or amount of awards, if any, made by the Redress Board in respect of the institutions listed below.

- St Mary's School for Hearing Impaired Girls, Cabra, Dublin 7.
- Mary Immaculate School for the Deaf, Beechpark, Co. Dublin
- Don Bosco House, Gardiner St, Dublin 1
- Baltimore Fisheries School for Senior Boys, Baltimore, Co. Cork.
- St Cecilia's, Cregg House, Sligo
- The Birds Nest, 19 York Road, Dún Laoghaire, Co. Dublin.
- Glensilva, 95 Monkstown Rd, Co Dublin.
- The Boys Home, Grand Canal Street, Dublin 2
- Racefield, Upper Mountown Rd, Dún Laoghaire, Co. Dublin
- The Cottage Home, Tivoli Road, Dún Laoghaire, Co. Dublin
- Miss Carr's Children's Home, 5 Northbrook Rd, Dublin 6.
- Scoil Eanna, Montenotte, Cork
- St. Bernadette's Montenotte, Cork
- St Paul's, Montenotte, Cork.
- St Anne's, Sean Ross Abbey, Roscrea, Co. Tipperary
- St Mary's, Delvin, Co Westmeath
- Kirwan House, Ranelagh, Dublin 6
- CPI Marino Special School, Bray, Co. Wicklow
- School of the Divine Child, Lavanagh, Ballintemple, Cork
- St Columba's Industrial School, Killybegs, Co. Donegal.
- Stewarts Hospital, Palmerstown, Dublin 20.
- Trudder House, Newtownmountkennedy, Co. Wicklow.
- Los Angeles Homes, Dublin
- Tabor House, 70 Seville Place, Dublin 1.

Item 4: A list of the property and lands offered by the Sisters of Mercy.

The Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy offered to contribute a total of 33 properties under the 2002 Indemnity Agreement and the transfer of 28 of these has been fully completed.

In the aftermath of the publication of the Ryan Report, the Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy offered to transfer some 48 additional properties to the State and State bodies, to the

voluntary sector and to the proposed statutory fund for former residents. The Government considered the proposals and agreed that a number of properties would be accepted by the State. The Government noted the proposed transfer of properties to the voluntary sector but agreed that only one could be reckoned as a contribution towards the cost of the redress response. The Government also requested the congregation to dispose of properties offered to the proposed statutory fund together with two properties offered to the State but in relation to which no State body expressed an interest in acquiring, and to provide the cash proceeds as a contribution.

4(a) Property offered under the 2002 Indemnity Agreement

Doon, Co Limerick
St Coleman's, Rushbrooke
Playing Field, Carna
Secondary School & Site, Ennistymon
Mohill Community School Site
Two Properties at Tuam
Nursery Buildings Goldenbridge
24 Westcourt, Tralee
Site at Glenamaddy
Deenagh House, Killarney
Vacant Buildings and Land at Rathdrum
Gate Lodge, Goldenbridge
1 Garravogue Road, Raheen, Co Limerick
23 Woodlea, Tralee, Co Kerry
Goldenbridge Group Homes
Ballymote, Co Sligo
15 The Willows, Mallow
Belmullet, Co Mayo
59 Hollybank Road, Drumcondra
Mount St Joseph Passage West
Building & Site at Edgeworthstown
Convent Land at Barrack Street, Limerick
Holy Cross Gardens, Killarney
Convent at Newport, Co. Mayo
Ballina, Co. Mayo
Airne Villa, Rock Road, Killarney, Co Kerry
6 Mount Vincent Terrace, Limerick
The Vineyard Child Centre, Rathdrum
Mounthawke, Tralee, Co Kerry (transfer not yet completed)
Cork Street, Dublin 8 (transfer not yet completed)
Coiscéim, Cappoquin, Waterford (transfer not yet completed)
Emohruo, Cappoquin, Waterford (transfer not yet completed)
Moate National School, Aghanaragit, Westmeath (transfer not proceeding).

4(b) Properties offered to the State and State bodies on a voluntary basis in 2009 and accepted for transfer

Convent and Boarding School, Clonakilty, Co. Cork to the Department of Education and Skills (**transfer completed**);

Former Primary School, Trim Co. Meath to the Department of Education and Skills (**transfer completed**);

Scoil Fatima, Ballinamore, Co. Leitrim to the Department of Education and Skills (**transfer completed**);

Former school, Ballyhaunis, Co Mayo to Mayo County Council (**transfer completed**);

Former school, Athboy, Co. Meath to Meath County Council (**transfer completed**).

St Joseph's VEC College, Carrick on Suir, Co Tipperary;

Adult Education Centre, Military Rd, Waterford;

Land at Convent Road, Cahir, Co Tipperary;

Seamount Convent and College, Kinvara, Co Galway;

Scoil Mhuire Secondary and Mercy primary School, Ennistymon, Co Clare;

Beaumont Convalescent Home, Beaumont, Dublin 9;

McAuley Centre, Kells, Co Meath – from Sisters of Mercy;

Site at the NRH, Dún Laoghaire and hospital lease to HSE;

St Patrick's Primary School, Altamont Street, Westport, Co Mayo;

St Anne's Lenaboy Castle, Taylor's Hill, Galway.

4(c) Properties offered on a voluntary basis in 2009 to the voluntary sector

It should be noted that the State is not a party to the transfer of any of the properties listed below. The information in relation to the status of individual properties is based on the most recent information provided by the legal advisors to the Congregation of the Sisters of Mercy. It should be noted that the only property transfer to the voluntary sector being reckoned as a contribution toward the cost of the response to residential institutional child abuse is the transfer of the former school at Tulla, Co. Clare to Comhaltas Ceolteoirí Éireann. The following contains a list of the property, the intended recipients and the Department's information on the current status of the transfer:

Convent, Bantry (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Cluid Social Housing has been completed).

Coláiste Íde, Dingle, Co Kerry (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Cáirde Coláiste Íde Teo. has been completed).

Old Primary School, Thomastown, Co. Kilkenny (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Scouting Ireland has been completed).

Tuam Junior School, Tuam, (The Department has been informed that the transfer to St. Vincent de Paul has been completed).

Convent, Granard, Co Longford (The Department has been informed that the transfer to the Sue Ryder Foundation has been completed).

Site for Tuam parish Pastoral Centre, Tuam (The Department has been informed that the transfer is not proceeding).

St Anne's Club, Avalon Centre Sligo (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Elphin Catholic Diocesan Trust has been completed).

Field at Ballyhaunis, Co Mayo (The Department has been informed that the transfer to St Jarlath's Trust has been completed).

Scoil Íosagáin, school building, Tullamore (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Tullamore Traveller's Pre-School Ltd has been completed).

St Colmcille's Centre and Site, Tullamore (The Department has been informed that the transfer to St Colmcille's Centre has been completed).

St Mary's Youth Centre, Tullamore (The Department has been informed that the transfer to St Mary's Youth Centre Ltd has been completed).

Leisure Centre, Buncrana, Co Donegal (The Department has been informed that the transfer has not been completed).

St Mary's Convent, Arklow, Co Wicklow (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Crosscare has been completed).

Community Centre, Templemore (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Templemore Parish Community Group has been completed).

Old Convent School & former primary school, Tulla, Co Clare (The Department has been informed that the transfer to Comhaltas Ceolteoirí Éireann has been completed and reckoned as a contribution).

4(d) Properties being disposed of (originally offered on a voluntary basis in 2009 to the proposed statutory fund plus two offered to the State).

16 Meadow Grove, Summerhill, Mallow, Co. Cork (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

7&8 Lisfennel Close, Dungarvan, Co. Waterford (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

39 Acres, Scartagh, Clonakilty Co. Cork

27 Acres - Compass Hill, Kinsale, Co. Cork (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

14 Acres - Callan, Co Kilkenny (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

110 Acres, Nohoval, Ballindeasig, Minane Bridge, Co Cork (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

6 Acres, Convent Rd, Cahir, Co. Tipperary

6 Acres, Skibbereen, Co. Cork

Ballinrobe Convent, Co Mayo (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Ardagh Demesne (214.5 acres and house and 2 gate lodges with milk quota of 75,749 gallons), Ardagh, Co. Longford (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Dundalk former Convent, Louth (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Kells Former Convent, Meath (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Clogher Head, Co Louth (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Rossnowlagh Co Donegal (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

13 Brookfield, Irishtown, Mullingar, Co. Westmeath (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Convent of Mercy, Cobh, Co. Cork (originally offered to the State) (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**)

Ballymahon Convent National School (originally offered to the State) (**property disposed of and proceeds provided**).

Item 5: A note to clarify the situation whereby Caranua has to begin paying rent from May 2017.

A note on this was furnished to the Committee by way of letter of 10 May 2017.

Additional Note 1: Properties transferring under the 2002 Indemnity Agreement

As the Committee will be aware, the Department agreed in principle with CORI that a total of 64 properties would be accepted subject to good and marketable title and agreed valuations. This number has reduced to 61 as the Department has accepted and received a cash sum in lieu of three properties where good and marketable title could not be established.

Since the last update in December 2016, three further properties have been finalised resulting in a position as at the current date, that a total of 53 properties have been fully transferred under the terms of the Agreement and there are no outstanding issues. The total value of these properties is €53,405,975. This represents 84% of the total monetary value of all the properties transferring under this aspect of the Indemnity Agreement excluding cash in lieu. A list of these properties and their valuations are attached at Appendix 1.

Work is continuing to complete the legal requirements to finalise the transfer process of the remaining 8 properties under the terms of the Indemnity Agreement – a list of those properties is attached at Appendix 2. This Department expects that a number of properties will be fully transferred under the Agreement in the next few months.

The Department is continuing to actively engage with the Chief State Solicitor's Office who liaise with the solicitors for the congregations and the solicitors acting on behalf of the HSE.

Additional Note 2: Christian Brothers' playing fields

Subsequent to the Committee's meeting of 13 April last, the Minister met with Brother Edmund Garvey, Province Leader of the Christian Brothers in Ireland at Brother Garvey's request.

Brother Garvey indicated that the Christian Brothers have reconsidered the offer made by Minister Quinn in relation to ownership of the playing fields whereby they would transfer ownership to the Edmund Rice Schools Trust (ERST) and that, in the event of any proposed transfer of such lands, the State would be entitled to receive 50% of the proceeds.

Brother Garvey also indicated that the Christian Brothers plan to dispose of some land currently used by Clonkeen College and the sale of the land will enable the Christian Brothers to complete their commitment to make cash contributions as part of their response to the Ryan report.

On 8 May last the Minister received a letter from Brother Garvey setting out this proposal. The Department intends to engage with the Christian Brothers on this matter and will provide a further update to the Committee in due course.

Appendix 1- Properties fully transferred under the 2002 Indemnity Agreement

	Property Fully & Finally Accepted	Value
1	Doon, Co Limerick	€640,000.00
2	St Coleman's, Rushbrook, Cork	€571,380.00
3	Playing Field, Carna, Co. Galway	€175,000.00
4	Secondary School & Site, Ennistymon, Co. Clare	€980,000.00
5	Mohill Community School Site	€520,000.00
6	Terenure Secondary School	€4,500,000.00
7	Site at Merrion	€8,900,000.00
8	Two Properties at Tuam, Co. Galway	€3,020,000.00
9	Nursery Buildings Goldenbridge	€570,000.00
10	24 Westcourt, Tralee	€184,110.00
11	Site at Glenamaddy, Co. Galway	€600,000.00
12	11 Acre Site at Virginia Road, Kells, Co. Meath	€825,000.00
13	Deenagh House, Killarney	€215,265.00
14	St Anne's Secondary School	€2,600,000.00
15	28 The Woodlands, Celbridge, Co. Kildare	€270,000.00
16	Vacant Buildings and Land at Rathdrum	€349,200.00
17	Gate Lodge, Goldenbridge	€220,000.00
18	1 Garravogue Road, Raheen, Co Limerick	€228,550.00
19	23 Woodlea, Tralee, Co Kerry	€152,370.00
20	Goldenbridge Group Homes	€1,269,700.00
21	Ballymote, Co Sligo	€38,000.00
22	15 The Willows, Mallow, Co. Cork	€114,280.00
23	Presentation Convent, Hospital, Co Limerick (to DES)	€175,000.00
24	Traveller Site at Blackrock, Co. Dublin	€3,045,000.00
25	St Teresa's, Temple Hill, Blackrock, Co. Dublin	€3,045,000.00
26	Belmullet, Co Mayo	€140,000.00
27	59 Hollybank Road, Drumcondra	€570,000.00
28	Mount St Joseph, Passage West, Cork	€914,210.00
29	Building & Site at Edgeworthstown	€598,045.00
30	Avondale, Waterford Road, Kilkenny	€330,000.00
31	Site at Longmile Road, Walkinstown	€325,000.00
32	Presentation Convent Hospital, Limerick (to HVHA)	€254,000.00
33	Convent Land at Barrack Street, Limerick	€625,000.00
34	2 Moyle Crescent, Clondalkin	€325,000.00
35	.28 Acre Site at Dolphin Park, Crumlin	€250,000.00
36	Holy Cross Gardens, Killarney	€1,270,000.00
37	23 Parnell Square, Dublin 1	€1,270,000.00
38	Convent at Newport, Co. Mayo	€635,000.00

39	Ballina, Co. Mayo	€38,000.00
40	Airne Villa, Rock Road, Killarney, Co Kerry	€221,615.00
41	6 Mount Vincent Terrace, Limerick	€400,000.00
42	Gentili, Farahoe, Innishannon, Cork	€228,600.00
43	Roseboro, 2 Firgrove Gardens, Bishopstown, Cork	€292,100.00
44	4 The Hawthorns, Macroom Road, Bandon, Cork	€215,900.00
45	5 Avondale Drive, Bandon, Cork	€190,500.00
46	The Vineyard Child Centre, Rathdrum, Co. Wicklow	€349,250.00
47	Lands at Mullaghmonaghan, Co Monaghan	€825,000.00
48	Benvon, 5 Bishopstown Road, Bishopstown, Cork	€279,400.00
49	Kidron, Roundhill, Old Chapel, Bandon, Cork	€266,700.00
50	St Patrick's Upton, Cork	€4,445,000.00
51	Respite Centre, Garretstown, Cork	€635,000.00
52	10 The Priory, Old Chapel, Cork	€304,800.00
53	Lands & Buildings at Lota, Glanmire, Cork	€4,000,000.00
		€53,405,975.00

Appendix 2 - Properties still to be fully transferred under the 2002 Indemnity Agreement

Properties not fully & finally completed

1	Former Old Schoolhouse, Garretstown, Co Cork
2	Mounthawke, Tralee, Co Kerry
3	Waterpark, Newtown Road, Waterford
4	Cork Street, Dublin 8
5	Coisceim, Cappoquin Waterford
6	Emohruo, Cappoquin Waterford
7	Sacred Heart Centre, Waterford
8	Moate National School, Aghanargit, Westmeath

